

# North Carolina Court of Appeals

## Docket Sheet

Hart, et al v. State of N.C., et al

**Case Number:** P14-210

**As of:** 03/28/2024

**Case Closed:** Yes

**Close Date:**

**Case Type:** Civil (Civil\_othr)

**Mediation:**

No

HART, ET AL.

PLAINTIFF-APPELLEE,

V.

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, ET AL.

DEFENDANT-APPELLANT

PERRY, ET AL.

INTERVENOR-DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS

RICHARDSON, ET AL.

PLAINTIFF-APPELLEE,

V.

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, ET AL.

DEFENDANT-APPELLANT

PERRY, ET AL.

INTERVENOR-DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS

**Docket Date:**

**File Date:**

**File Time:**

**Acquired Date:** 03-18-2014

**Bond Collected:** No

**Docket Fee:** No

**Pauper:** No

**Print Deposit:** No

**State Appeals:** No

**History**

**Venue:** Wake (10)

**Heard In:** Superior Court

**To SC:**

**From SC:**

**Lower Court Number(s)**

**Location:** Wake (10)

**Judge:**

**Case #:** 13-CVS-16484 13-CVS-16771;

**Tracking/Argue**

**Opinion**

## Documents

| Document        | Date Recvd | Cert of Service | Rec/Brf Due | Resp. Due  | Resp. Recvd | Mailed Out | Ruling        | Ruling Date |
|-----------------|------------|-----------------|-------------|------------|-------------|------------|---------------|-------------|
| (1) PWS         | 03-18-2014 | 03-18-2014      |             | 04-02-2014 | see below   |            | Special Order | 04-02-2014  |
| (2) M-TEMP-STAY | 03-18-2014 | 03-18-2014      |             |            |             |            | Special Order | 03-19-2014  |
| (3) M-P-HAC-V   | 03-19-2014 | 03-18-2014      |             |            |             |            | Allowed       | 03-20-2014  |
| (4) M-P-HAC-V   | 03-19-2014 | 03-18-2014      |             |            |             |            | Allowed       | 03-20-2014  |
| (5) M-P-HAC-V   | 03-19-2014 | 03-18-2014      |             |            |             |            | Allowed       | 03-20-2014  |
| (6) M-P-HAC-V   | 03-19-2014 | 03-19-2014      |             |            |             |            | Allowed       | 03-20-2014  |
| (7) M-GEN       | 04-08-2014 | 04-08-2014      |             |            |             |            | Allowed       | 04-10-2014  |
| (8) OTHER       | 06-27-2014 | 06-27-2014      |             |            |             |            |               |             |

---

1 - PWS (Special Order) - 04-02-2014

Filed: 03-18-2014 @ 16:39:20

FOR:

BY : Mr. Richard D. Komer  
INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE

The following order was entered:

The petition filed in this cause by defendant-intervenors on 18 March 2014 and designated 'Petition for Writ of Supersedeas and Temporary Stay' is decided as follows. The petition for writ of supersedeas is denied.

By order of the Court this the 2nd of April 2014.

The above order is therefore certified to the Clerk of the Superior Court, Wake County.

---

RESPONSE TO PWS

Filed: 03-31-2014

BY : Mr. Robert F. Orr

---

RESPONSE TO PWS

Filed: 03-31-2014

BY : Mr. Burton Craige  
PATTERSON HARKAVY LLP

---

2 - M-TEMP-STAY (Special Order) - 03-19-2014

Filed: 03-18-2014 @ 16:39:50

FOR:

BY : Mr. Richard D. Komer  
INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause by defendant-intervenors on 18 March 2014 and designated 'Petition for Writ of Supersedeas and Temporary Stay' is decided as follows. The motion for temporary stay is denied. The petition for writ of supersedeas shall be decided upon the filing of a response by plaintiff, or upon the expiration of the period for a response, if no response is filed.

By order of the Court this the 19th of March 2014.

---

3 - M-P-HAC-V (Allowed) - 03-20-2014

Filed: 03-19-2014 @ 08:31:42

FOR:

BY : Mr. Robert Thomas Numbers, II  
WOMBLE CARLYLE SANDRIDGE & RICE, PLLC

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause on the 19th of March 2014 and designated 'Motion of Renee Flaherty for Admission PRO HAC VICE' is allowed. Renee Flaherty is admitted to practice pro hac vice in the appeal from 13 CVS 16484. Some panels of this Court require sponsoring counsel to be present for oral argument.

By order of the Court this the 20th of March 2014.

---

4 - M-P-HAC-V (Allowed) - 03-20-2014

Filed: 03-19-2014 @ 08:35:28

FOR:

BY : Mr. Robert Thomas Numbers, II  
WOMBLE CARLYLE SANDRIDGE & RICE, PLLC

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause on the 19th of March 2014 and designated 'Motion of Richard Komer for Admission PRO HAC VICE' is allowed. Richard Komer is admitted to practice pro hac vice in the appeal from 13 CVS 16484. Some panels of this Court require sponsoring counsel to be present for oral argument.

By order of the Court this the 20th of March 2014.

---

5 - M-P-HAC-V (Allowed) - 03-20-2014

Filed: 03-19-2014 @ 08:40:32

FOR:

BY : Mr. Robert Thomas Numbers, II  
WOMBLE CARLYLE SANDRIDGE & RICE, PLLC

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause on the 19th of March 2014 and designated 'Motion of Renee Flaherty for Admission PRO HAC VICE' is allowed. Renee Flaherty is admitted to practice pro hac vice in the appeal from 13 CVS 16771. Some panels of this Court require sponsoring counsel to be present for oral argument.

By order of the Court this the 20th of March 2014.

---

6 - M-P-HAC-V (Allowed) - 03-20-2014

Filed: 03-19-2014 @ 08:40:55

FOR:

BY : Mr. Robert Thomas Numbers, II  
WOMBLE CARLYLE SANDRIDGE & RICE, PLLC

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause on the 19th of March 2014 and designated 'Motion of Richard Komer for Admission PRO HAC VICE' is allowed. Richard Komer is admitted to practice pro hac vice in the appeal from 13 CVS 16771. Some panels of this Court require sponsoring counsel to be present for oral argument.

By order of the Court this the 20th of March 2014.

---

7 - MOTION NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE (Allowed) - 04-10-2014

Filed: 04-08-2014 @ 16:29:12

FOR:

BY : Mr. Robert F. Orr

The following order was entered:

The motion filed in this cause on the 8th of April 2014 and designated 'Notice of Withdrawal of Appearance' is allowed. Robert F. Orr is permitted to withdraw as counsel of record.

By order of the Court this the 10th of April 2014.

8 - OTHER  
 Filed: 06-27-2014 @ 09:47:40  
 FOR:  
 BY : Mr. Robert F. Orr  
 POYNER & SPRUILL, LLP

### Financial Information

#### Receipts

| Date Charged | Charge Type  | Amount Charged | Amount Paid | Document | Pages | Receipt #  | Date Paid  |
|--------------|--------------|----------------|-------------|----------|-------|------------|------------|
| 03-19-2014   | Pro Hac Vice | 225.00         | 225.00      |          |       | R042008414 | 04-11-2014 |
| 03-19-2014   | Pro Hac Vice | 225.00         | 225.00      |          |       | R042008514 | 04-11-2014 |
| 03-19-2014   | Pro Hac Vice | 225.00         | 225.00      |          |       | R042008614 | 04-11-2014 |
| 03-19-2014   | Pro Hac Vice | 225.00         | 225.00      |          |       | R042008714 | 04-11-2014 |

### Exhibits

### Parties

|                         |                     |
|-------------------------|---------------------|
| Party Name              | Role                |
| State of North Carolina | Defendant-Appellant |

### Attorneys

#### Attorney for -

Mr. Richard D. Komer [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

rkomer@ij.org

Ms. Renee D. Flaherty [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

rflaherty@ij.org

INSTITUTE FOR JUSTICE

901 N. Glebe Road

Suite 900

Arlington, VA 22203

(703) 682-9320

#### Attorney for -

Mr. Robert Thomas Numbers, II [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

rnumbers@wcsr.com

WOMBLE CARLYLE SANDRIDGE & RICE, PLLC

555 Fayetteville Street, Suite 1100  
P.O. Box 831 (27602)  
Raleigh, NC 27601  
(919) 755-2100

---

**Attorney for -**

Mr. Burton Craige [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

bcraige@pathlaw.com

PATTERSON HARKAVY LLP

1312 Annapolis Drive Suite 103

Raleigh, NC 27608

(919) 755-1812

---

**Attorney for -**

Ms. Lauren M. Clemmons [Primary Attorney]

Special Deputy Attorney General

lclemmons@ncdoj.gov

Ms. Tiffany Y. Lucas [Primary Attorney]

Deputy General Counsel

tlucas@ncdoj.gov

P. O. Box 629

Raleigh, NC 27602

(919) 716-6500

---

**Attorney for -**

Ms. Laura Crumpler [Primary Attorney]

Special Deputy Attorney General

lauraellencrumpler@gmail.com

Ms. Melissa L. Trippe [Primary Attorney]

Special Deputy Attorney General

mtrippe@ncdoj.gov

N.C. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

P.O. Box 629

Raleigh, NC 27602

(919) 716-6920

---

**Attorney for -**

Mr. Edwin M. Speas, Jr. [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

espeas@poynerspruill.com

POYNER & SPRUILL, LLP

301 Fayetteville Street, Suite 1900

P.O. Box 1801 (27602)

Raleigh, NC 27601

(919) 783-1152

---

**Attorney for -**

Ms. Carrie Virginia McMillan [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

cmcmillan@poynerspruill.com

P.O. Box 1801

Raleigh, NC 27602

(919) 783-2868

---