

# SUPREME COURT OF NORTH CAROLINA

## Docket Sheet

Dickson, et al v Rucho, et al

**Case Number:** 201PA12  
**As of:** 06/24/2018  
**Case Closed:** Yes      **Close Date:** 02-14-2013      **Case Type:** Civil (Civil\_othr)

MARGARET DICKSON, ET AL

v

ROBERT RUCHO, ET AL

NORTH CAROLINA STATE CONFERENCE OF BRANCHES OF THE NAACP, ET AL

v

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, ET AL

**Docket Date:** 05-04-2012      **Acquired Date:** 05-04-2012  
**Bond Collected:** No      **Docket Fee:** No      **Pauper:** No      **Rule 16b:** No

**History**

**Venue:** Wake (10)      **Previous Venue:** Wake (10)

**Lower Court Number(s)**

Location: Wake (10)

Judge:

Case #: 11CVS16896 11CVS16940

**Tracking/Argue**

Argue Date: 07-10-2012 #

**Opinion**

Opinion Date: 01-25-2013      Cert Date: 02-14-2013

Author: Honorable Barbara Jackson

Decision: Affirmed in Part, Reversed in Part and Remanded

Opinion Notes: Beasley, J. did not participate in the consideration or decision of this case. Hudson, J. dissenting

Opinion Pages: 30      Opinion Cost: \$ 6.00

Cite: 366 NC 332

Slip Opinion: <https://appellate.nccourts.org/opinions/?c=1&pdf=29687>

**Documents**

Document	Date Recvd	Cert of Service	Rec/Brf Due	Resp. Due	Resp. Recvd	Mailed Out	Ruling	Ruling Date
(1) M-TEMP-STAY	05-04-2012						Spec Order	05-11-2012

(2) PWS	05-04-2012				05-09-2012	06-05-2012	Spec Order	05-11-2012
(3) RECORD	05-31-2012					06-04-2012		
(4) RECORD	05-31-2012					06-04-2012		
(5) RECORD	05-31-2012					06-04-2012		
(6) RECORD	05-31-2012					06-04-2012		
(7) M-GEN	06-15-2012						Dismissed	01-24-2013
(8) M-GEN	06-15-2012				06-25-2012		Allowed	01-24-2013
(9) APPELLANT BRIEF	06-15-2012					06-18-2012		
(10) M-AMICUS	06-27-2012						Allowed	06-29-2012
(11) M-AMICUS	06-29-2012						Allowed	06-29-2012
(12) APPELLEE BRIEF	06-29-2012					07-02-2012		
(13) AMICUS	06-27-2012					07-02-2012		
(14) AMICUS	06-29-2012					07-02-2012		
(15) REPLY	07-06-2012					07-09-2012		
(16) ADD-AUTH	07-09-2012							
(17) M-GEN	11-21-2012						Denied	12-17-2012
(18) M-GEN	12-04-2012						Allowed	12-17-2012

---

**1 - APPLICATION FOR TEMPORARY STAY (Spec Order) - 05-11-2012**

Filed: 05-04-2012 @ 10:15:40

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Phillip J. Strach

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK &amp; STEWART, P.C.

---

**2 - PETITION FOR WRIT OF SUPERSEDEAS (Spec Order) - 05-11-2012**

Filed: 05-04-2012 @ 09:44:41

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Phillip J. Strach

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK &amp; STEWART, P.C.

---

**RESPONSE TO PETITION FOR WRIT OF SUPERSEDEAS**

Filed: 05-09-2012

BY : Mr. Edwin Speas

POYNER SPRUILL

---

**3 - RECORD**

Filed: 05-31-2012 @ 17:03:16

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK &amp; STEWART, P.C.

---

**4 - RECORD**

Filed: 05-31-2012 @ 17:04:07

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK &amp; STEWART, P.C.

---

**5 - RECORD**

Filed: 05-31-2012 @ 17:04:52

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK &amp; STEWART, P.C.

---

**6 - RECORD**

Filed: 05-31-2012 @ 17:05:57

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK &amp; STEWART, P.C.

---

7 - MOTION THAT THE COURT TAKE JUDICIAL NOTICE OF PUBLIC RECORDS (Dismissed) - 01-24-2013

Filed: 06-15-2012 @ 15:14:13

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr  
OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

---

RESPONSE TO MOTION THAT THE COURT TAKE JUDICIAL NOTICE OF PUBLIC RECORDS

Filed: 06-25-2012

BY : Mr. Edwin Speas  
POYNER SPRUILL

---

8 - MOTION IN THE ALTERNATIVE TO SUPPLEMENT RECORD ON APPEAL (Allowed) - 01-24-2013

Filed: 06-15-2012 @ 15:37:30

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr  
OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

---

RESPONSE TO MOTION IN THE ALTERNATIVE TO SUPPLEMENT RECORD ON APPEAL

Filed: 06-25-2012

BY : Mr. Edwin Speas  
POYNER SPRUILL

---

9 - APPELLANT BRIEF

Filed: 06-15-2012 @ 15:58:21

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Phillip J. Strach  
OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

---

10 - MOTION TO FILE AMICUS BRIEF (Allowed) - 06-29-2012

Filed: 06-27-2012 @ 10:07:32

FOR: Amicus N.C. Association of Broadcasters, Inc.

BY : Mr. Mark J. Prak  
BROOKS, PIERCE, MCLENDON, HUMPHREY & LEONARD, LLP

---

11 - MOTION TO FILE AMICUS BRIEF (Allowed) - 06-29-2012

Filed: 06-29-2012 @ 14:09:45

FOR: Amicus N.C. Open Government Coalition, Inc.

BY : Mr. Hugh Stevens  
STEVENS MARTIN VAUGHN & TADYCH, PLLC

---

12 - APPELLEE BRIEF

Filed: 06-29-2012 @ 16:50:26

FOR: Plaintiff-Appellee Dickson, Margaret, et al

BY : Mr. Edwin Speas  
POYNER SPRUILL

---

13 - OTHER BRIEF

Filed: 06-27-2012 @ 09:11:36

FOR: Amicus NC Press Association, Inc., et al

BY : Mr. John A. Bussian  
THE BUSSIAN LAW FIRM

---

14 - OTHER BRIEF

Filed: 06-29-2012 @ 09:11:53

FOR: Amicus N.C. Open Government Coalition, Inc.

BY : Mr. Hugh Stevens  
STEVENS MARTIN VAUGHN & TADYCH, PLLC

---

15 - APPELLANT BRIEF

Filed: 07-06-2012 @ 15:19:34

FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al

BY : Mr. Phillip J. Strach  
OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

---

16 - MEMOS

Filed: 07-09-2012 @ 12:50:30

FOR: Plaintiff-Appellee Dickson, Margaret, et al

BY : Mr. Edwin Speas  
POYNER SPRUILL

---

17 - MOTION FOR RECUSAL OF JUSTICE PAUL NEWBY (Denied) - 12-17-2012

Filed: 11-21-2012 @ 10:26:36

FOR: Plaintiff-Appellee Dickson, Margaret, et al

BY : Mr. Edwin Speas  
POYNER SPRUILL

RESPONSE TO MOTION FOR RECUSAL OF JUSTICE PAUL NEWBY  
 Filed: 12-03-2012  
 BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr

18 - MOTION TO AMEND RESPONSE TO MOTION FOR RECUSAL OF PAUL NEWBY (Allowed) - 12-17-2012  
 Filed: 12-04-2012 @ 15:21:30  
 FOR: Defendant-Appellant Rucho, Robert et al  
 BY : Mr. Thomas A. Farr

RESPONSE TO MOTION TO AMEND RESPONSE TO MOTION FOR RECUSAL OF PAUL NEWBY  
 Filed: 12-07-2012  
 BY : Ms. Anita S. Earls  
 SOUTHERN COALITION FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE

**Financial Information**

**Receipts**

Date Charged	Charge Type	Amount Charged	Amount Paid	Document	Pages	Receipt #	Date Paid
07-02-2012	Printing	17.50	17.50	OTHER BRIEF	10	R071002212	07-09-2012
07-02-2012	Printing	21.00	21.00	OTHER BRIEF	12	R071003512	07-13-2012
07-02-2012	Printing	131.25	131.25	APPELLEE BRIEF	75	R071003412	07-13-2012
02-19-2013	Assess	1651.75	1651.75			R021004713	02-25-2013
06-04-2012	Printing	388.50	388.50	RECORD	222	R061001512	06-12-2012
06-04-2012	Printing	243.25	243.25	RECORD	139	R061001612	06-12-2012
06-04-2012	Printing	264.25	264.25	RECORD	151	R061001712	06-12-2012
06-04-2012	Printing	281.75	281.75	RECORD	161	R061001812	06-12-2012
06-05-2012	Printing	269.50	269.50	PETITION	154	R061001912	06-12-2012
05-07-2012	Docket Fee	10.00	10.00			R051004712	05-23-2012
06-18-2012	Printing	101.50	101.50	APPELLANT BRIEF	58	R071005412	07-24-2012
07-09-2012	Printing	84.00	84.00	APPELLANT BRIEF	48	R071005512	07-24-2012

**Payments**

Payment Date	Payment Type	Amount	Check Number
02-27-2013	Disburse	465.00	3974
02-27-2013	Disburse	1177.75	3975

**Parties**

Party Name	Role
Dickson, Margaret, et al	Plaintiff-Appellee
Rucho, Robert et al	Defendant-Appellant
North Carolina State Conference Of Branches Of The NAACP, et al	Plaintiff-Appellee
State of North Carolina, et al	Defendant-Appellant
Tillis, Thom	Defendant-Appellant
Berger, Philip E.	Defendant-Appellant
Lewis, David	Defendant-Appellant

Dickson, Margaret	Plaintiff-Appellee
Chisolm, Alisha	Plaintiff-Appellee
Clark, Ethel	Plaintiff-Appellee
McLean, Matthew A.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Rollizo, Melissa Lee	Plaintiff-Appellee
Gantt, C. David	Plaintiff-Appellee
Underhill, Alice Graham	Plaintiff-Appellee
Jancis, Armin	Plaintiff-Appellee
Judge, Rebecca	Plaintiff-Appellee
Williams, Zettie	Plaintiff-Appellee
Burns-Van, Tracey	Plaintiff-Appellee
Campbell, Lawrence	Plaintiff-Appellee
Robinson, O. Everette (Jr.)	Plaintiff-Appellee
Garrou, Linda	Plaintiff-Appellee
McNeill, Hayes	Plaintiff-Appellee
Shaw, Jim	Plaintiff-Appellee
Dunston, Sidney E.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Adams, Alma	Plaintiff-Appellee
Coley, Jason Edward	Plaintiff-Appellee
Fields, Karl Bertrand	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stubbs, Pamlyn	Plaintiff-Appellee
Etheridge, Bob	Plaintiff-Appellee
Graham, George (Jr.)	Plaintiff-Appellee
Chumley, Thomas M.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Dew, Aisha	Plaintiff-Appellee
Gregory, Geneal	Plaintiff-Appellee
Leake, Vilma	Plaintiff-Appellee
Moore, Rodney W.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stevenson, Brenda Martin	Plaintiff-Appellee
Whitley, Jane	Plaintiff-Appellee
Valentine, I.T. (Tim)	Plaintiff-Appellee
Watkins, Lois	Plaintiff-Appellee
Joyner, Richard	Plaintiff-Appellee
Jones, Randall S.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Townsend, Bobby Charles	Plaintiff-Appellee
Kirby, Albert	Plaintiff-Appellee
Williams, Terrence	Plaintiff-Appellee
Camp, Norman C.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Poole, Mary H.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Smith, Stephen T.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Everett, Robinson O. (Jr.)	Plaintiff-Appellee
Wilson, Douglas A.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Poole, Mary F.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Chairman of NC Senate Redistricting Committee	Defendant-Appellant

Chairman of NC House of Representatives Redistricting Committee	Defendant-Appellant
President Pro Tempore of the NC Senate	Defendant-Appellant
Speaker of the NC House of Representatives	Defendant-Appellant
NC State Board of Elections	Defendant-Appellant
North Carolina State Conference Of Branches Of The NAACP	Plaintiff-Appellee
League of Women Voters of North Carolina	Plaintiff-Appellee
Democracy North Carolina	Plaintiff-Appellee
North Carolina A. Philip Randolph Institute	Plaintiff-Appellee
McNair, Reva	Plaintiff-Appellee
Davis, Matthew	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stanton, Tressie	Plaintiff-Appellee
Wilson, Anne	Plaintiff-Appellee
Hightower, Sharon	Plaintiff-Appellee
Brandon, Kay	Plaintiff-Appellee
Wells, Goldie	Plaintiff-Appellee
Newman, Gray	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stafford, Yvonne	Plaintiff-Appellee
Dawkins, Robert	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stohler, Sara	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stohler, Hugh	Plaintiff-Appellee
Rainey, Octavia	Plaintiff-Appellee
Hodge, Charles	Plaintiff-Appellee
Hardy, Marshall	Plaintiff-Appellee
Gardenhight, Martha	Plaintiff-Appellee
Taylor, Ben	Plaintiff-Appellee
Rivers, Keith	Plaintiff-Appellee
Murphy, Romallus O.	Plaintiff-Appellee
White, Carl	Plaintiff-Appellee
Brodie, Rosa	Plaintiff-Appellee
Lewis, Herman	Plaintiff-Appellee
Albert, Clarence	Plaintiff-Appellee
Bailey, Evester	Plaintiff-Appellee
Brown, Albert	Plaintiff-Appellee
Lanier, Benjamin	Plaintiff-Appellee
Vaughn, Gilbert	Plaintiff-Appellee
Lester, Avie	Plaintiff-Appellee
Muchiteni, Theodore	Plaintiff-Appellee
Hobbs, William	Plaintiff-Appellee
Hawkins, Jimmie Ray	Plaintiff-Appellee
Bullock, Horace P.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Waddle, Roberta	Plaintiff-Appellee
Davis-McCoy, Christina	Plaintiff-Appellee
William, James Oliver	Plaintiff-Appellee
Speed, Margaret	Plaintiff-Appellee

Brooks, Larry Laverne	Plaintiff-Appellee
Allen, Carolyn S.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Rogers, Walter (Sr.)	Plaintiff-Appellee
Meachem, Shawn	Plaintiff-Appellee
Bonaparte, Mary Green	Plaintiff-Appellee
Love, Samuel	Plaintiff-Appellee
Patterson, Courtney	Plaintiff-Appellee
Sinclair, Willie O.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Brown, Cardes Henry (Jr.)	Plaintiff-Appellee
Stephens, Jane	Plaintiff-Appellee
State of N.C.	Defendant-Appellee
Truitt, Valeria	Plaintiff-Appellee
Bowden, R. Steve	Plaintiff-Appellee
Vaughan, Don	Plaintiff-Appellee
McLawhorn, Melvin C.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Baddour, Philip A.	Plaintiff-Appellee
Rucho, Robert	Defendant-Appellant
Dollar, Nelson	Defendant-Appellant
Dockham, Jerry	Defendant-Appellant

### Attorneys

#### **Attorney for Defendant-Appellant - Rucho, Robert et al**

[Mr. Phillip J. Strach] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

phil.strach@ogletreedeakins.com

[Mr. Thomas A. Farr]

Attorney at law

tom.farr@ogletreedeakins.com

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

4208 Six Forks Road

Suite 1100

Raleigh, NC 27609

(919) 787-9700

#### **Attorney for Plaintiff-Appellee - Dickson, Margaret, et al**

[Mr. Edwin Speas] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

espeas@poynerspruill.com

Mr. John W. O'Hale

Guardian ad Litem

johale@poynerspruill.com

Ms. Caroline P. Mackie

Attorney at Law

cmackie@poynerspruill.com

POYNER SPRUILL  
Post Office Box 1801  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
(919) 783-1108

---

**Attorney for Defendant-Appellant - State of North Carolina, et al**

[Mr. Alexander McC. Peters] [Primary Attorney]

Senior Deputy Attorney General

apeters@ncdoj.gov

[Ms. Susan K. Nichols]

Special Deputy Attorney General

snichols@ncdoj.gov

N.C. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

P.O. Box 629  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
(919) 716-6500

---

**Attorney for Plaintiff-Appellee - Dickson, Margaret, et al**

[Ms. Anita S. Earls] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

anitaearls@southerncoalition.org

[Ms. Allison J. Riggs]

Attorney at Law

allison@southerncoalition.org

[Clare Barnett]

Attorney at Law

clarebarnett@southerncoalition.org

SOUTHERN COALITION FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE

1415 West Highway 54  
Suite 101  
Durham, NC 27707  
(919) 323-3380

---

**Attorney for Plaintiff-Appellee - North Carolina State Conference Of Branches Of The NAACP, et al**

[Mr. Adam Stein] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

astein@fergusonstein.com

FERGUSON STEIN CHAMBERS GRESHAM & SUMTER

312 West Franklin Street  
Chapel Hill, NC 27516  
(919) 240-7089

---

**Attorney for Plaintiff-Appellee - North Carolina State Conference Of Branches Of The NAACP, et al**

Mr. Irving Joyner [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

ijoyner@ncsu.edu



P.O. Box 335  
Durham, NC 27702  
(919) 319-8353

---

**Attorney for Plaintiff-Appellee - North Carolina State Conference Of Branches Of The NAACP, et al**

Mr. Victor Goode [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

vgoode@naacpnet.org

NAACP

4805 Mount Hope Drive

Baltimore, MD 21215

(410) 580-5120

---

**Attorney for Amicus - NC Press Association, Inc., et al**

[Mr. John A. Bussian] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

jbussian@aol.com

THE BUSSIAN LAW FIRM

Wells Fargo Capitol Center

150 Fayetteville Street Mall, 17th Fl.

Raleigh, NC 27601

(919) 306-3319

---

**Attorney for Amicus - N.C. Association of Broadcasters, Inc.**

[Mr. Mark J. Prak] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

mprak@brookspierce.com

Mr. Charles E. Coble

Attorney at Law

ccoble@brookspierce.com

[Dorrian H. Horsey]

Attorney at Law

BROOKS, PIERCE, MCLENDON, HUMPHREY & LEONARD, LLP

P.O. Box 1800

Raleigh, NC 27602

(919) 839-0300

---

**Attorney for Amicus - N.C. Open Government Coalition, Inc.**

[Mr. Hugh Stevens] [Primary Attorney]

Attorney at Law

hugh@smvt.com

STEVENS MARTIN VAUGHN & TADYCH, PLLC

The Historic Pilot Mill

1101 Haynes Street, Suite 100

Raleigh, NC 27604

(919) 582-2300

---